Introduction

This essay will compare the two different ethical standpoints that both John and Mary have who work in a healthcare clinic. John is trying to get one of his clients to quit smoking and Mary wants John’s client to quit smoking, however believes that John’s ethical theory is unethical. First, this essay will begin by discussing John’s theory, followed by Mary’s theory.

Fallacy Theory

The theory that John is using are known as fallacies. John is using the falsehood of telling his client that there will be testing for nicotine in workplaces and that if nicotine is found in the employee they will be excluded from the work environment. Although Mary is right that John’s theory with the motivation of helping his client is unethical, fallacies and falsehoods often do work effectively for achieving one’s goals. An example can be in the 1800s when general society felt that a woman was a second person and was unable to work. It was not until World War I when all the men were off to war and women needed to enter the workforce that this fallacy was broken and then men started to understand that women were capable of working outside of the home. These events of women working outside of the home also led to women receiving the right to work in the 1920s. It is potentially because of these fallacies why Mary finds John’s theory to be unethical. Most likely, although John feels confident that his client will believe him and take him at his word and all other efforts that he has made to try to get his client to quit smoking cigarettes have not worked, he is now resorting to fallacies in order to try to have his client quit smoking cigarettes. John’s theory may also be that even if his client discovers that John lied to him, or used the theory of fallacies in order to get his client to stop smoking that by time he would have found out he would have formed healthy habits of quitting smoking and prevent himself from the likelihood of dying from a smoking-related disease.

John is probably right that by time the client would discover that what John told him was a fallacy, he would have quit smoking effectively. In this sense, although Mary does not agree with John and she is right that it is unethical, it would most likely work and the fallacy in this case (unlike the example that women are second-class citizens), would benefit the client more than it would hurt the client. Now, I will discuss Mary’s theory.

Truth Theory

The theory that Mary is working with is simply known as truth. Mary believes that the reason John’s theory of fallacy is not ethical is because it is not the truth and it is not ethical to lie to your client even if you are doing it for their benefit and for their better good. Mary is right. Even with many of the official Psychological Associations for medical and health practitioners, under no circumstances can they lie to their clients or their licenses could be at risk to practice in their field because if the client were to complain about the fallacy theory being used, then someone such as John would no longer be able to help any client to quit smoking, ruining his passionate career and the strong role he has already played in helping so many people to quit smoking.

Conclusion

In conclusion, John does a good reason to consider using the fallacy theory for his client, however Mary is being more prudent and more thoughtful in her thinking by understanding and by realizing that John could be risking his whole career based on the fallacy theory.